

Title	An Interplay of Learning, Creativity and Narrative Biography in a Mental Health Setting: Bertie's Story
Type	Article
URL	<a href="http://ualresearchonline.arts.ac.uk/301/">http://ualresearchonline.arts.ac.uk/301/</a>
Date	2007
Citation	Sagan, Olivia (2007) An Interplay of Learning, Creativity and Narrative Biography in a Mental Health Setting: Bertie's Story. <i>Journal of Social Work Practice</i> , 21 (3). pp. 311-321. ISSN 0265-0533 print 1465-3885 online
Creators	Sagan, Olivia

### **Usage Guidelines**

Please refer to usage guidelines at <http://ualresearchonline.arts.ac.uk/policies.html> or alternatively contact [ualresearchonline@arts.ac.uk](mailto:ualresearchonline@arts.ac.uk).

License: Creative Commons Attribution Non-commercial No Derivatives

Unless otherwise stated, copyright owned by the author

# Olivia Sagan

## AN INTERPLAY OF LEARNING, CREATIVITY AND NARRATIVE BIOGRAPHY IN A MENTAL HEALTH SETTING: BERTIE'S STORY

*This paper describes selected findings from a research study exploring the use of a basic literacy/creative writing course provided in a community setting for adults with long-term mental health difficulties. It explores one case in particular, where long-term mental illness coupled with limited verbal articulation and low levels of literacy presented significant barriers to learning, creativity and the construction of narrative. However, whilst little movement or development could be discerned in some participant cases where recognisable barriers were less formidable, the case study selected illustrates a resilience and agency on the part of one individual which enabled incremental but significant development. The paper suggests that seeking the creative in the writing, or the meaning in the words was to overlook the actual creative act, which was the resilient, reparative process of coming to terms with a new identity and a new self narrative.*

**Keywords** narrative; literacy; mental illness; identity

### Introduction

Life can only be understood backwards. In the meantime it has to be lived forwards.

(Kierkegaard)

The social context within which mentally ill adults with low levels of education can access learning opportunities offering scope for creative expression is fraught. Pressures exerted through the educational policy discourses of Widening Participation (HEFCE, 2000), Inclusive Learning (Tomlinson, 1996), Skills for Life (DfEE, 2001), and the requirements of the Disability Discrimination Act part 4 (DRC, 2001) have urged educational and community providers to act upon obligations to offer learning opportunities to adults with disabilities and/or mental illness. Corollaries of Care in the Community (DoH, 1990) continue to highlight concern over what support is

*Journal of Social Work Practice* Vol. 21, No. 3, November 2007, pp. 311–321

ISSN 0265-0533 print/ISSN 1465-3885 online © 2007 GAPS

<http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals> DOI: 10.1080/02650530701553617



0 provided for the reintegration of mentally ill individuals into a society both hostile to 0  
 mental illness (Cross, 2004) and increasingly unable to offer employment  
 opportunities to vulnerable, less skilled individuals. Meanwhile, New Labour has  
 promoted a discourse of social inclusion (Levitas, 1998) and is seen to have backed  
 initiatives and strategies to increase participation. However, despite this climate  
 5 within both health and education the socio-political context of this research appeared 5  
 riddled with jarring discourses and beleaguered by eroded funding and ossified  
 structural inequality. Whilst the learning needs of adults with mental health  
 difficulties have, in the past decade, become the subject of increased concern at both  
 educational and policy level and have triggered sometimes awkward marriages  
 10 between the domains of education and health (Sagan, 2002, 2004), learning provision 10  
 for mentally ill adults largely remains theoretically neglected, pedagogically  
 unexamined and politically overlooked.

15 Many of the learning opportunities now accessible are designed, taught and 15  
 assessed from within an ethos of education being instrumental in national  
 development and commercial competitiveness. There is a heavy stress on technicist  
 pedagogy and the aim of 'upskilling' the learner in ways most congruent with market  
 demands. Both teachers and learners are subject to the audit anxiety which runs  
 through heavily regimented provision (Cooper, 2001). This discourse, which collapses  
 20 concepts of lifelong learning and social inclusion with an economic skills imperative 20  
 (Barton *et al.*, 2004; Appleby & Bathmaker, 2006) circulates uneasily within the  
 small, under funded community premises frequented by the long-term mentally ill  
 participants in this study. Their concept of learning and writing was more tied to  
 notions of day-to-day survival and the development and/or maintenance of a bearable  
 25 personal narrative. Opportunities for social interaction were deemed important in 25  
 breaking the isolation of mental illness, and the *concreteness* of writing (Pennebaker &  
 Segal, 1999) was highly valued, as expressed by one participant:

30 ... just ... getting it down on paper, it makes me feel, better somehow to see it 30  
 there ... I know what I think then, when I see what I've said ...

Ben 30

35 Learning programmes are largely designed, funded and delivered with a fantasised 35  
 non-gendered individual in mind, who is rarely consulted and seldom if ever  
 considered as a whole person rather than a fragmented construction of 'bits' to be  
 manipulated, medicated, taught and processed, the 'subject-positions' of Foucault  
 (1980). This individual is situated within a contestable social construction of mental  
 illness (Busfield, 1996) which, though clumsy, offensive and ill-representative of  
 40 experience, nevertheless feeds popular imagery and fears, and contributes to a 40  
 constrained set of identities being formulated by mentally ill adults themselves. Any  
 notion of learning or in this case literacy and self-expression as inherently *creative* acts  
 is absent. Indeed, if creativity can be posited, as it is in this paper, as an ability to  
 integrate, to link, bring together (Segal, 1957) and tolerate disparate ideas and  
 warring identities, then the atomised and fragmentary mode of thinking and operating  
 45 within education for mentally ill adults can be seen as not only denuded of any *creative* 45  
 thought, but actually constituting an *attack* on thinking (Rustin, 2001).

0 It is within this problematic landscape that this research took place, seeking to 0  
 catch a glimpse of whether such a terrain allowed space for individuals *not to discover*  
*what we are, but refuse what we are* (Foucault, 1982, p. 216) and make some attempt,  
 despite all odds, at living life *forwards* through writing creatively.

## 5 Methodology 5

Immersion in the setting for substantial duration, typical of ethnographic research,  
 was vital to being able to establish a working rapport and trust with the small group of  
 10 individuals in this study. Comfortable, non-intrusive access not only to the writing 10  
 sessions and work produced therein, but other activities and areas of the community  
 setting, was essential to the gathering of data across a number of domains. The aim of  
 the research was to observe what *use*<sup>1</sup> was made of a basic literacy/creative writing  
 15 course which was provided for mentally ill adults with mostly low levels of literacy  
 and limited verbal articulation. 15

All 11 individuals who took part in the three year study are long-term mentally ill  
 and although they represent a range of diagnoses they all share the experience of  
 debilitating depression for which they have been regularly hospitalised and are in  
 receipt of numerous and varied medications. Ethical considerations were of  
 20 paramount concern, particularly as the study progressed and I was told things 20  
 informally, in the canteen, or on fag breaks, information which I considered  
 important but for which I needed to gain renewed consent in order to use as data.  
 Whilst both written and regularly re-requested verbal consent has been obtained for  
 the information in this paper, all names and identities have been altered. 25

The research employed a critical ethnographic methodology (Tamboukou & Ball,  
 2003) primarily in its first phase, to examine a range of data and maintain maximum  
 flexibility in a volatile setting subject to sudden funding crises; organisational  
 restructuring and participant absence and/or withdrawal. In subsequent phases of the  
 30 project the focus was on the biographic narrative interviews, which continued 30  
 regularly throughout the three years. These interviews used an adapted form of the  
 Biographic Narrative Interpretive Method (Wengraf, 2001) and aimed to elicit life  
 story narrative from the participants in the study. Levels of articulation and verbal  
 engagement varied dramatically however, and with two participants in particular it  
 35 was not until the research progressed well into the second year that interviews began 35  
 to contain more of the 'risky narrative' which was to afford insights into the identity  
 work apparently being carried out.

It is the data from the individual narrative interviews which underpin the  
 substantive focus of this paper, although other data in the form of session observation  
 40 notes; interview notes (of the process rather than the content); course documentation 40  
 and examples of participants' creative work are drawn on to substantiate and/or  
 question the biographic data. It is from this tracing and juxtaposing that questions  
 were raised regarding the narrative which was being performed in the interview  
 setting, and how it differed in some cases quite strikingly from the 'self' portrayed in  
 45 other domains. As the site of strenuous identity work, the course as a whole appeared 45  
 to be 'used' in the psychoanalytic sense as a particular object, parts of which needed

0 to be nurtured and kept good, while others were subject to various forms of subtle 0  
 attack. Whilst the aim of the sessions was to help mentally ill adults write creatively,  
 (even, or specifically from within the bounds of very low levels of literacy) this paper  
 suggests that the creative impulse was being expressed through a diligent  
 development, maintenance of, or defending against particular identities. I also  
 5 suggest that creativity is a hard-earned luxury for the individuals in this research, 5  
 whose day-to-day survival was a paramount theme throughout their narratives. This  
 hard-earned luxury appeared to demand a high level of containment (Bion, 1967) on  
 the part of facilitators, the group and the setting itself; it also demanded the sense of at  
 least the *potential* for secure attachments (Bowlby, 1969). These prerequisites were  
 10 partially met through the sessions and the research itself by dint of duration, stability 10  
 and sensitivity to psychic traffic and inter-subjectivity on the part of the facilitator  
 (French, 1997) and researcher. These were the very factors which were continually  
 under attack as a result of funding constraints and un-fit for purpose curriculum  
 demands specifically, and the 'instrumentalism within modern welfare services'  
 15 (Froggett, 2002, p. 39) more generally. 15

Psychosocial questioning positing a defended subject (Holloway & Jefferson,  
 2000) was applied in an attempt to understand undercurrents in the emerging data  
 and to keep alive a constant awareness of each individual being at once a product of a  
 particular constellation of psychological factors *and* a subject constructed by a  
 20 particular socio-political structure whose cultural and historic creation of mental 20  
 illness is shifting and contingent (Foucault, 1991). The psychoanalytic concepts drawn  
 on are those most closely associated with Kleinian, post-Kleinian and object-relations  
 theorists, predominantly splitting, projective identification, reparation and contain-  
 ment. Within this framework particular attention is paid to experiences of anxiety and  
 25 defending against it, and perceived loss, both heavily implicated in a psychoanalytic 25  
 understanding of learning. It is this framework that appears, in my experience as a  
 counsellor and educator, to have greatest fluency when considering the learning  
 process of mentally ill adults, which is usually fraught, often distressing, and  
 sometimes potentially harmful as destructive behaviours are revisited upon the site of  
 30 learning and interminable knots of suffering are tied through failure and stasis. The 30  
 case study from which I extract here, however, depicts a special resilience and tiny yet  
 significant changes. This accomplishment supports the claim that holistic, therapeutic  
 and containing welfare can support the conditions in which learning, integration and  
 more creativity can take place, even amongst learners who present with a range of  
 35 characteristics which constitute formidable barriers to development. Unlike several 35  
 other cases studied where the individual appeared entrenched in a paranoid-schizoid  
 position (Klein, 1946) wherein self-narrative was locked tight in a denial of past  
 experience and inability to envisage a different future, Bertie's case offered a glimpse  
 of a movement into the depressive position, where ambivalence could be thought,  
 40 reparation begun and a new narrative of self spun. 40

### **Bertie: when words don't come easy**

45 A 65-year-old Yorkshireman, Bertie was well known at the centre, having attended 45  
 on and off for more than 10 years. Stocky, with a plethoric complexion, pronounced

0 limp and difficult breathing, Bertie came weekly to the centre to share a cuppa, get 0  
 some lunch and chat with the other users. He had never taken up any of the  
 recreational or educational services on offer: art classes; yoga; computing for  
 beginners. Neither had he ever added his name to the waiting list for counselling:

5 ... No, not for me, not for the likes of me ... I w, w, w, wouldn't know what to 5  
 say, 'livia, wouldn't 'ave a clue ...

Bertie

Bertie came from what can perhaps be nostalgically and inadequately categorised  
 10 as 'the traditional working class' — and his narrative is threaded through with the 10  
 confusions and angers of a tribe displaced by a new work order (Collins, 2004) and  
 demonised by a media which fails to recognise its own bigotry towards the British  
 working class (Hari, 2007). Many of his comments regarding the changes he had been  
 15 confronted with in his neighbourhood expressed fear and anxiety about not knowing 15  
 or understanding the 'newcomers' and not being able to 'say nuffin' in case he was  
 branded a racist. A disjointed cultural allegiance seemed to be further confounded by  
 the ravages of mental ill health, which splintered chronology and memory, and  
 demanded that Bertie reposition himself as mentally ill first and foremost, rather than  
 20 of going to Majorca. Bertie suffered with several serious medical conditions, was 20  
 diagnosed with depression and acute anxiety, and lived in a studio flat on a council  
 estate notorious locally for its declining standards and disgraceful levels of noise, dirt  
 and despair. When he put his name down for the literacy/creative writing course, it  
 came as a surprise to staff and volunteers at the centre who, while liking Bertie for his  
 25 affable character, nevertheless saw him as a 'revolving door' user; one who due to his 25  
 age, history and general low level of education and articulation would never really  
 improve or progress therapeutically or educationally. Gradually however, over the  
 course of our interviews and interactions in the writing sessions I observed, Bertie  
 began to speak, through his stutters and malapropisms, of his contempt for the  
 30 poverty in which he grew up, and the heavy burden of what he termed his 'dysleptic' 30  
 (sic) problems, i.e. his lack of ability to write, which he put down to dyslexia  
 (undiagnosed). Despite all predictions, over time he also improved his writing ability  
 and began to broach the idea of self-expression — how this was achieved is reflected  
 on below.

35 35

### Bertie: Fords, fags and reparation

Observations of Bertie over the first year in which he took part in three 10-week  
 40 courses show very little movement in terms of the educational progress required by 40  
 educational providers and their funders, in this case the Learning and Skills Council  
 (LSC). His rigidly upper case writing remained stubbornly at the level of a nine year  
 old, void of punctuation and with a vocabulary predictably poorer than his verbal  
 vocabulary. He often stuttered and stammered when taking part in the gentle group  
 45 discussion around themes the group were encouraged to write about, and he 45  
 frequently resorted to slap-sticky jokes and puns. Early interviews were a difficult 20

0 minutes to half hour, with Bertie responding to questions but unable or reluctant to 0  
 elaborate, perhaps because he remained incredulous that anything of his life, of him  
 — ‘thick, or mad, they’ve called me, or white trash, something like that’ — would  
 be of interest to anybody. However, at the end of the second year, there were some  
 5 shifts across the domains of writing, group session and the biographical interviews, 5  
 and I want now to describe these shifts and to detail to what I believe them  
 attributable. I will then suggest what the ramifications of these shifts may be in terms  
 of the creativity of Bertie’s pursuits, and what the messages are to emerge from this in  
 terms of educational provision and creative processes for mentally ill adults with low  
 levels of articulation and literacy.

10 Although Bertie made frequent jokes about his being ‘dysleptic’, too old to learn, 10  
 that writing wasn’t for him — ‘I leave that up to my daughter, she’s got lovely  
 handwriting, she ‘as ...’ — the developing biographic narrative told a private,  
 harrowing story about an upbringing in a charitable religious boarding school for boys  
 which was riddled with humiliations, physical, sexual and emotional abuse. Much of  
 15 the humiliation and bullying focused on his being ‘thick’ and not able to learn; and the 15  
 stories Bertie gradually told me through stutters and stammers and wheezes suggested  
 a bank of memories involving schooling and its loathsome authoritative figures. This  
 bank, while long relegated to some distant and safe part of Bertie’s mind, nevertheless  
 had left him with a sense of unfinished business regarding learning, regarding literacy  
 20 and writing in particular, which he felt as a noticeable absence in his life: ‘if I could say 20  
 it, like, get it down on paper ... it’d be out there ...’.

Bertie had a heavy emotional investment in learning which was two-fold; firstly, if  
 he could learn, in the basic sense of moving from one point of knowledge to another,  
 he stood to settle some old score with those who had written him off. Secondly,  
 25 writing, literacy, the physicality of its presence on paper, would somehow restore 25  
 validity to his stories which Bertie did not deem them to have without ‘proof’ — a  
 written *proof* of a subjective experience (Milner, 1950), granted to those ‘with letters’  
 but denied him, who had few. For Bertie, the gap between an inner subjective  
 30 experience and an expression of it had widened, for while his life had changed and 30  
 circumstances had shifted, Bertie had not had appropriate spaces in which his verbal  
 articulation and literacy might be allowed play and development. Milner (1950,  
 p. 132) suggests this gap is what expressive pursuit seeks to address:

35 ... there is (also) a gap between the inner reality of feeling and the available ways 35  
 of communicating what we feel ... it is a gap that is bigger wherever the  
 conditions of our living are changing rapidly so that the old forms for describing  
 our feeling experiences become no longer adequate.

40 Yet it was not until the second year that Bertie began to show some changes in his 40  
 writing, which, while remaining rigidly prosaic and arduous to execute, showed some  
 embryonic signs of development in terms of subject matter. His writing become more  
 autobiographical and included a moving short description of his many years at the  
 Ford factory where he tumbled, as a result of ill health, from semi-skilled worker to  
 45 floor cleaner. It also suggested he accessed more control and choice; words would be 45  
 substituted for others — ‘that’s better, aint it, it says it better’ — rather than the first

0 option being hurriedly settled for. Bertie's relationship to the product itself also 0  
 changed. Whereas once torn up or stuffed into a pocket, his morning's work would  
 now be carefully placed on the table for collection, or smoothed out and put inside a  
 folder. By the end of the third year he was learning to word process his short  
 paragraphs and poems and this also appeared to give a private sense of pleasure to him  
 5 which was nothing short of moving to observe. 5

Simultaneously, Bertie's engagement with the interviews was deepening. This  
 engagement I suspect was possible because whilst within the framework of the BNIM  
 (Wengraf, 2001) interview Bertie was invited to tell me his life story, our time  
 10 together was not flooded with the preconceived ideas Bertie held about what 10  
 constituted counselling, ideas which jarred with his image of himself as a white,  
 working-class man — an image which had been steadily under attack through ill  
 health, divorce, changing socio-political circumstances, and the depletion of a local  
 population to whom he felt affiliated. 'Doing the research' was bizarrely something he  
 15 felt he could say to his mates downstairs during fag breaks, when they asked why he 15  
 was late; 'Doing the writing' was also, just about acceptable — whereas 'doing  
 counselling' sat less comfortably.

Bertie's interviews gradually deepened in scope allowing for a flooding of  
 feeling and unearthing of memories. He spoke, still through stutters and stumbles,  
 20 puns and quips, about his early life at the convent, his class allegiances about which 20  
 he felt betrayal, and latterly his fears of aging and dying. The interviews became  
 more poignant; strikingly candid; there was a sense, for me, of a childlike, 'true'  
 expression: 'It is speech as true self, the verbal equivalent of Winnicott's  
 "squiggle" or the moment when, according to Lacan, the subject discovers his own  
 25 voice, revealed through slips of the tongue and curious wordings' (Bollas, 1999, 25  
 p. 72).

This good use of the interview space and time was striking (and not mirrored by  
 all participants) — but it took time, much more time than the short-term counselling  
 Bertie would have had access to through the centre. This use was also augmented by  
 30 the domains of the group sessions and the writing itself. So while Bertie was busy 30  
 dissecting certain experiences in the interview setting, 'safe' parts of this could be  
 taken into the writing sessions — without the fear of the emotional content of the  
 work spilling out uncontrollably within the more public domain. In exchange, the  
 potential loss felt in the sessions through the development, in writing, of a new  
 35 narrative supplanting an old, fractured, obsolete but still habitual one, could be 35  
 articulated back in the interviews — 'it's good, yeah (the writing) but it's not me, not  
 like ... I've never really written nothing, never been good with words ...'.

This containment within which new subject positions could be taken up and new  
 identities explored, appeared to be alleviating anxiety within the writing sessions  
 40 sufficiently to enable firstly, some actual slow, hard learning to occur, and secondly, 40  
 further strengthening of a new narrative as week after week Bertie saw stories of  
 himself build up in the concrete form of writing on paper.

Furthermore, as his work slowly, incrementally progressed and his attendance  
 stabilised, Bertie's connection with the group and his identity as a member in it  
 45 strengthened. Bertie became well known as the group joker, with other members 45  
 referring to previous jokes and quips within the new history of their time together:



0 ... Bertie, remember the one you told us about the tea, the mobile phone and T 0  
mobile? Tell it again — go on!

Observation notes (Cathy)

5 The affinity and empathy within the group was specifically aided through the weekly 5  
public demonstration of a shared weakness in writing. Although some members were  
clearly more adept than others, the combination of joint discussion of personal themes  
with the challenge of writing about these appeared to bind the group to itself in a  
private and intimate way not shared by other social groupings and cliques at the  
centre.

10 This time together spilled from the group sessions to fag breaks, to informal 10  
get-togethers — spinning its own history and narrative which fed back into the bank  
of memories to which the group itself began to refer. This particular group dynamic  
offered a personal supportive domain as learning came easily to none of them and all  
members shared a knowledge of the ravages of mental illness on words, self  
15 identity, memory and self-expression. It supplied Bertie with yet another arena in 15  
which *to be* and to try out a new identity. The containing function of the writing and  
the interview space which could ultimately hold the emotion and pain seemed to  
free up the site of the group sessions. Bertie could relax and be the joker without,  
20 for once, the jokes masking parts of himself which had nowhere else to be. Finally, 20  
but significantly, there was an unexpected and deepening companionship over the  
two years between himself and another user at the same centre with whom he  
discovered very similar shared experiences of class, whiteness, mental illness and  
the onset of older age.

25 So what was going on? I am not suggesting that Bertie was accessing a 'true self' 25  
nor that he was co-constructing (through his interaction with myself in the interviews,  
the individuals in the group sessions, the facilitator or the writing) a new, 'truer'  
narrative. The delightful, if frustrating challenges of postmodernism wrought upon  
the modernism of psychotherapy have highlighted hierarchical notions of 'truth'  
30 inherent in discourses which suggest a truer self is accessed through practices of 30  
therapy, creativity and autobiography. So the written Ford story, the development of  
Bertie the Joker, the painful narrative being unwound in the interviews, do not *in*  
*themselves* represent either more valuable, more articulate or in any way cathartic self  
narratives, and we need to be mindful of the danger of *reducing meaning to that which*  
35 *can be narrated* (Frosh, 2002, p. 134). What they do imply is that the gaps and leakages 35  
of the different practices and the challenges, for Bertie, of engagements with other  
ways of being — offered moments of both *frisson* and disjuncture. These could be  
experienced and tolerated by Bertie from the vantage point of the depressive position,  
partly because they were being contained within a sufficiently robust framework. This  
40 included not only the writing and the group sessions, but the research activity *itself*; 40  
the corrective emotional experience offered through Bertie's newfound form of  
companionship, and small changes in his socio-economic standing which opened the  
possibility of, quite simply, greater quality of life. A space was opening up for Bertie  
— and in this opening up, this man, with his stuttering, limited articulation, his slow  
45 and cumbersome handwriting, and his dreams of watching the world cup live, was 45  
thinking not only of the immediate, two-dimensional now, but of the past,

0 repopulated with richer stories and encounters, and of a future which held other than 0  
 sheer fear — in Kleinian terms the mourning and reparation achieved were enabling  
 the embryonic beginnings of creative activity (Klein, 1988). The words Bertie used,  
 either in the interviews or his short written pieces, were now less populated with the  
 intentions of others (Bakhtin, 1981) and more full of his own. Bertie's negotiation of  
 5 the rocky terrain of frisson, disjunction, gaps and leakages *was* the creative act. It 5  
 demanded tolerating ambivalence and the shock of the new; a capacity for  
 symbolisation and the making of the reparative acts of remembering and recreating —  
 it involved living life forwards.

### 10 Learning how to spell 'creative' 10

Learning, always a risky encounter with 'difficult knowledge' and necessary  
 unlearning (Britzman, 1998, 2006) occurring at a place where the internal and  
 15 external worlds meet, demands the very capacities which are under attack when we 15  
 are caught anywhere along the spectrum from emotionally disturbed to chronically  
 mentally ill. These are the same capacities which are denuded or eradicated in a  
 paranoid–schizoid mode of being and operating.

At the same time debates surrounding what constitutes creativity seldom take  
 20 place within the confines of policy and practice regarding mental health and adult 20  
 literacy. Notoriously ill-defined and subjectively apprehended, creativity is regarded  
 by the participants I worked with as something out of reach — 'not for the likes of us'  
 was a term much used — because of their class, because of their illness, because of  
 the myriad of needs in the quest for a day to day survival which are more pressing.

25 Despite persuasive evidence that there continues to be a link between some forms 25  
 of mental illness and creative outpourings (Jamison, 1993) the sad truth on the ground  
 is that for many mentally ill individuals their illness means a stripping away, a  
 depletion of colour, sensitivity and delight, and a narration always 'dissonant with the  
 experience intended by its account' (Stone, 2004, p. 19) which amounts to vacuum  
 30 and loss rather than creation. 30

So both learning and creativity seem to request that we suspend reality, trust in a  
 journey with an unknown destination and create an object able to hold *and* portray  
 our abstruse intentions, yearnings and phantasies. This is a tall order when our notions  
 35 of self are undermined, our narrative fragmented, trust betrayed and faith in objects 35  
 eroded. Whilst creative pursuits and learning can also *restore* or recreate a sense of  
 identity, narrative, trust and faith, this study suggests that both learning and creativity  
 have a list of demands as prerequisites to their magic. These demands — which are  
 pedagogic, psychodynamic, social — exceed what is on offer, both from the welfare  
 40 sector and the education sector. What is on offer is usually something very different 40  
 — the provision of a mechanistic course with a tick list of learning objectives  
 complying with a scheme dreamt up in an adult education co-ordinator's office. This  
 scheme, oblivious to the human waste caught up in its limitations, is designed in  
 accordance with the spurious guidelines laid down by a government for whom Bertie,  
 45 at the end of this food chain, is a faceless, mentally ill 'hard-to-reach' statistic in 45  
 danger of social exclusion.

0 **Note** 0

1 'Use' here has the double meaning of (1) how participants used this provision, e.g.  
 as a social, educational and/or recreational activity and what role it came to play in  
 their lives, but also (2) what use was made in the psychoanalytic sense of 'object  
 5 use' (Winnicott, 1969). 5

**References**

- 10 Appleby, Y. & Bathmaker, A. M. (2006) 'The new skills agenda: increased lifelong 10  
 learning or new sites of inequality?', *British Educational Research Journal*, vol. 32,  
 pp. 703–717.
- Bakhtin, M. M. (1981) *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*, University of Texas Press,  
 Texas.
- 15 Barton, D., Ivanic, R., Appleby, Y., Hodge, R. & Tusting, K. (2004) *Adult Learners' Lives* 15  
*Project: Setting the Scene*, NRDC, Institute of Education, University of London,  
 London.
- Bion, W. R. (1967) *Second Thoughts*, William Heinemann Medical Books Limited,  
 London.
- 20 Bollas, C. (1999) *The Mystery of Things*, Routledge, London. 20
- Bowlby, J. (1969) *Attachment and Loss, Volume 1: Attachment*, Hogarth Press and the  
 Institute of Psychoanalysis, London.
- Britzman, D. P. (1998) *Lost Subjects, Contested Objects: Toward a Psychoanalytic Study of*  
*Learning*, State University of New York, Albany, NY.
- 25 Britzman, D. P. (2006) *Novel Education: Psychoanalytic Studies of Learning and Not Learning*, 25  
 Peter Lang, New York.
- Busfield, J. (1996) *Men, Women and Madness: Understanding Gender and Mental Disorder*,  
 Macmillan Press Ltd, Basingstoke.
- Collins, M. (2004) *The Likes of Us: A Biography of the White Working Class*, Granta Books,  
 London.
- 30 Cooper, A. (2001) 'The state of mind we're in: social anxiety, governance and the audit 30  
 society', *Psychoanalytic Studies*, vol. 3, pp. 349–362.
- Cross, S. (2004) 'Visualizing madness: mental illness and public representation', *Television*  
*and New Media*, vol. 5, pp. 197–216.
- 35 DfEE (2001) *Skills for Life: The National Strategy for Improving Adult Literacy and Numeracy* 35  
*Skills*, DfEE Publications, Nottingham.
- DoH (1990) *Care in the Community: Making It Happen*, HMSO, Department of Health,  
 London.
- DRC (2001) *Disability Discrimination Act Part 4 (SENDA) (Vol. HMSO)*.
- 40 Foucault, M. (1980) *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and other Writings 1972–1977*, 40  
 Pantheon, New York.
- Foucault, M. (1982) 'Afterward: the subject and power', in *Michel Foucault: Beyond*  
*Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, eds H. Dreyfus & P. Rabinow, 2nd edn, University of  
 Chicago Press, Chicago, pp. 208–226.
- Foucault, M. (1991) *Madness and Civilization*, Routledge, London.
- 45 French, R. B. (1997) 'The teacher as container of anxiety: psychoanalysis and the role of 45  
 the teacher', *Journal of Management Education*, vol. 21, pp. 483–495.

- 0 Froggett, L. (2002) *Love, Hate and Welfare: Psychosocial Approaches to Policy and Practice*, The Policy Press, Bristol. 0
- Frosh, S. (2002) *After Words: The Personal in Gender, Culture and Psychotherapy*, Palgrave, Basingstoke.
- Hari, J. (2007) 'Jaded contempt for the working class', *The Independent Newspaper* [online] Available at: [http://comment.independent.co.uk/columnists\\_a\\_1/johann\\_hari/article2175017.ece](http://comment.independent.co.uk/columnists_a_1/johann_hari/article2175017.ece). 5
- HEFCE (2000) *Widening Participation: Special Funding Proposals*, Higher Education Funding Council for England, Bristol.
- Holloway, W. & Jefferson, T. (2000) *Doing Qualitative Research Differently: Free Association, Narrative and the Interview Method*, Sage, London. 10
- Jamison, K. R. (1993) *Touched with Fire: Manic-Depressive Illness and the Artistic Temperament*, Simon Schuster, New York. 10
- Klein, M. (1946) 'Notes on some schizoid mechanisms', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, vol. 27, pp. 99–110.
- Klein, M. (1988) *Love, Guilt and Reparation and Other Works 1921–1945*, Virago, London. 15
- Levitas, R. (1998) *The Inclusive Society? Social Exclusion and New Labour*, Macmillan, London. 15
- Milner, M. (1950) *On Not Being Able to Paint*, Heinemann, Oxford.
- Pennebaker, J. W. & Seagal, J. D. (1999) 'Forming a story: the health benefits of narrative', *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, vol. 55, pp. 1243–1254.
- 20 Rustin, M. (2001) *Reason and Unreason: Psychoanalysis, Science and Politics*, Continuum, London. 20
- Sagan, O. (2002) 'Teaching psychiatric patients: a psychoanalytic study', *Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy*, vol. 16, pp. 58–73.
- Sagan, O. (2004) 'Mental health policy in FE — the spaces in between', *AUCC Journal*, Autumn, pp. 6–8. 25
- Segal, H. (1957) 'Notes on symbol formation', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, vol. 38, pp. 391–397.
- Stone, B. (2004) 'Towards a writing without power: notes on the narration of madness', *Auto/Biography*, vol. 12, pp. 16–33.
- 30 Tamboukou, M. & Ball, S. J. (eds) (2003) *Dangerous Encounters: Genealogy and Ethnography*, Peter Lang Publishing, Inc., New York. 30
- Tomlinson, J. (1996) *Inclusive Learning: Report of the Learning Difficulties and/or Disabilities Committee*, HMSO, London.
- Wengraf, T. (2001) *Qualitative Research Interviewing: Biographic Narrative Semi-structured Methods*, Sage, London. 35
- 35 Winnicott, D. W. (1969) 'The use of an object and relating through identifications', in *Playing and Reality*, Tavistock, London. 35

---

40 **Olivia Sagan** is a Senior Research Fellow at the University of the Arts, London. Address: University of the Arts, 2–6 Catton Street, London WC1R 4AA, UK. [email: o.sagan@arts.ac.uk] 40

---